



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
09/888,987	06/25/2001	Michael Robert Costello	H0002504	9552

23859 7590 04/30/2007
NEEDLE & ROSENBERG, P.C.
SUITE 1000
999 PEACHTREE STREET
ATLANTA, GA 30309-3915

EXAMINER

VAN BRAMER, JOHN W

ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
----------	--------------

3622

MAIL DATE	DELIVERY MODE
-----------	---------------

04/30/2007

PAPER

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

Office Action Summary	Application No. 09/888,987	Applicant(s) COSTELLO ET AL.	
	Examiner John Van Bramer	Art Unit 3622	

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on February 12, 2007.
- 2a) ☐ This action is **FINAL**. 2b) ☒ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 1-28 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) _____ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 1-28 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) _____ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☐ The drawing(s) filed on _____ is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

- 12) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some * c) ☐ None of:
1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

Attachment(s)

- | | |
|--|---|
| 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892) | 4) <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413)
Paper No(s)/Mail Date. _____ |
| 2) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) | 5) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application |
| 3) <input type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO/SB/08)
Paper No(s)/Mail Date _____ | 6) <input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____ |

DETAILED ACTION

Continued Examination Under 37 CFR 1.114

1. A request for continued examination under 37 CFR 1.114, including the fee set forth in 37 CFR 1.17(e), was filed in this application after final rejection. Since this application is eligible for continued examination under 37 CFR 1.114, and the fee set forth in 37 CFR 1.17(e) has been timely paid, the finality of the previous Office action has been withdrawn pursuant to 37 CFR 1.114. Applicant's submission filed on February 12, 2007 has been entered.

Response to Amendment

2. The amendment filed on February 12, 2007 cancelled no claims. No claims were added and Claims 1, 17, and 23 were amended. Thus the currently pending claims remain Claims 1-28.

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 103

3. The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

(a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negated by the manner in which the invention was made.

Art Unit: 3622

4. Claims 1 – 28 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Fishbein (Carpet Take-Back: EPR American Style, Environmental Quality Management, Autumn 2000, pg 25 – 36).

Claim 1: Fishbein discloses a method for recovering carpet comprising polymeric fibers.

- a. Selling carpet to a consumer. (Page 31, Paragraph 1) (Fishbein discloses that under a capital lease ownership of the carpet is transferred to the lessee which means a sale of the item has taken place. Fishbein also discloses in the cited section that Interface provides this type of lease.)
- b. While Fishbein does not explicitly disclose that a database is established and maintained that contains information regarding installed carpet and consumers it is obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art at the time the invention was made that a database containing the type of carpet, installation date, useful lifetime of the carpet, and consumer identification would have been necessary in order for Interface to purchase, maintain, replace the carpet over the period of the lease, and recycle it at the end of its useful life. (Page 30, Column 2, lines 39 – 43) One would have been motivated to do this in order to provide the leasing customer with the services that have been promised.
- c. Additionally Fishbein does not explicitly disclose estimating the useful lifetime of the installed carpet, contacting the consumer, or collecting the carpet within a determined period of time from the end of the estimated useful lifetime of the

carpet. However, this would have been inherently necessary in order to replace and recycle the carpet at the end of life when the carpet is provided on a leasing arrangement. (Page 30, Column 2, lines 39 – 43)

- d. Fishbein discloses sorting the collected carpet according to polymeric fiber type. (Page 27, Column 2, lines 1 – 17, and Page 28, Column 1, lines 27 – 39)
- e. Fishbein also discloses converting the polymeric fibers into a recovered polymer composition. (Page 28, Column 1, lines 1 – 11)

Claim 2: Fishbein discloses the method of claim 1 further comprising the subsequent step of forming an article from the recovered polymer composition. (Post consumer commercial carpet made from the company's nylon 6 fibers is produced)(Page 28, Column 2, lines 13 – 27)

Claim 3: Fishbein discloses the method of claim 1 further comprising the subsequent step of forming polymeric fibers from the recovered polymer composition. (Post consumer commercial carpet made from the company's nylon 6 fibers is produced, in order to produce this carpet new polymeric fibers had to be formed)(Page 28, Column 2, lines 13 – 27)

Claim 4: Fishbein discloses the method of claim 1 further comprising the subsequent step of forming polymeric fibers from the recovered polymer composition and then forming the polymeric fibers into a carpet. (Post consumer commercial

Art Unit: 3622

carpet made from the company's nylon 6 fibers is produced)(Page 28, Column 2, lines 13 – 27)

Claim 5: Fishbein discloses the method of claim 1 wherein step of converting the polymeric fibers into a recovered polymer composition comprises depolymerizing at least one type of polymeric fiber into its monomeric components. (Depolymerization was used) (Page 28, Column 2, lines 13 – 27)

Claim 6: Fishbein discloses the method of claim 1 wherein step of converting the polymeric fibers into a recovered polymer composition comprises depolymerizing at least one type of polymeric fiber into its monomeric components and then repolymerizing the monomeric components to form the recovered polymer composition. (Post consumer commercial carpet made from the company's nylon 6 fibers is produced, in order to produce this carpet new polymeric fibers had to be formed)(Page 28, Column 2, lines 13 – 27)

Claim 7: Fishbein discloses the method of claim 6 further comprising the subsequent step of forming an article from the recovered polymer composition. (Post consumer commercial carpet made from the company's nylon 6 fibers is produced)(Page 28, Column 2, lines 13 – 27)

Claim 8: Fishbein discloses the method of claim 6 further comprising the subsequent

Art Unit: 3622

step of forming fibers from the recovered polymer composition. (Post consumer commercial carpet made from the company's nylon 6 fibers is produced)(Page 28, Column 2, lines 13 – 27)

Claim 9: Fishbein discloses the method of claim 6 further comprising the subsequent step of forming fibers from the recovered polymer composition and then forming the fibers into a carpet. (Post consumer commercial carpet made from the company's nylon 6 fibers is produced)(Page 28, Column 2, lines 13 – 27)

Claim 10: Fishbein discloses the method of claim 1 wherein the converting step comprises depolymerizing a nylon polymeric fiber into its monomeric components. (Post consumer commercial carpet made from the company's nylon 6 fiber is produced)(Page 28, Column 2, lines 13 – 27)

Claim 11: Fishbein discloses the method of claim 1 wherein the converting step comprises depolymerizing a nylon 6 polymeric fiber into its monomeric components. (Post consumer commercial carpet made from the company's nylon 6 fiber is produced)(Page 28, Column 2, lines 13 – 27)

Claims 12, 21 and 25: Fishbein discloses the methods of claim 1, 17 and 23 respectively. While Fishbein is silent with regard to establishing and maintaining a database conducted via a global computer network, Official Notice is taken that the

use of distributed databases is old and well known. Many companies, including carpet retailers have used distributed databases to maintain customer records. Carpet One and CarpetMax are two well known examples of national carpet retailers that utilize such databases to communicate between various retail locations. It would have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art to utilize a distributed database over a network in order to consolidate customer information. One would have been motivated to do so in order to provide personalized service and maintenance to customers regardless of the retail location at which they decide to visit.

Claims 13 and 22: Fishbein discloses the methods of claim 1 and 17 respectively. While Fishbein is silent with regard to how the customer is contacted in order to maintain and replace the leased carpet (Page 30, Column 2, lines 39 – 43), Official notice it taken that contacting customers by mail, telephone, telefax, and electronic mail are all old and well-known business practices. Therefore, it would have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art at the time of the invention to contact the customer via one of these methods. One would have been motivated to do this in order to set up an appointment to replace or maintain the customer's carpet.

Claim 14: Fishbein discloses the method of claim 1 further comprising the step after step c) of providing the consumer with a replacement carpet. (Page 30, Column 2, lines 39 – 43)

Claim 15: Fishbein discloses the method of claim 1. While Fishbein is silent with regard to installing the carpet at the consumer's location it does disclose purchasing, leasing and maintaining the carpet. It would have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art at the time of the invention that the step of installing the carpet is an integral step in the leasing process. Furthermore it would have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art at the time of the invention that the carpet would have to be installed in order to perform the step of maintaining the carpet (Page 28, Column 2, lines 13 – 27). One would have been motivated to perform the installation step in order to entice customers to participate in the leasing arrangement.

Claim 16: Fishbein discloses the method of claim 1 further comprising providing the consumer with an incentive to replace the carpet. (The disclosure that "Most of the voluntary take-back programs are not free" indicates that there are a couple of these programs that are free. Since the standard procedure is to charge a customer for the disposal of carpet in a landfill, offering such a take-back service that is free is an economic incentive to the customer) (Page 35, Column 1, lines 33 – 46)

Claim 17: Fishbein discloses a method for recovering carpet comprising polymeric fibers.

- a. Selling carpet to a consumer. (Page 31, Paragraph 1) (Fishbein discloses that under a capital lease ownership of the carpet is transferred to the lessee which

means a sale of the item has taken place. Fishbein also discloses in the cited section that Interface provides this type of lease.)

- b. While Fishbein is silent with regard to installing the carpet at the consumer's location it does disclose purchasing, leasing and maintaining the carpet. It would have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art at the time of the invention that the step of installing the carpet is an integral step in the leasing process. Furthermore it would have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art at the time of the invention that the carpet would have to be installed in order to perform the step of maintaining the carpet (Page 28, Column 2, lines 13 – 27). One would have been motivated to perform the installation step in order to entice customers to participate in the leasing arrangement.
- c. While Fishbein does not explicitly disclose that a database is established and maintained that contains information regarding installed carpet and consumers it is obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art at the time the invention was made that a database containing the type of carpet, installation date, useful lifetime of the carpet, and consumer identification would have been necessary in order for Interface to purchase, maintain, replace the carpet over the period of the lease, and recycle it at the end of its useful life. (Page 30, Column 2, lines 39 – 43) One would have been motivated to do this in order to provide the leasing customer with the services that have been promised.
- d. Additionally Fishbein does not explicitly disclose estimating the useful lifetime of the installed carpet, contacting the consumer, or collecting the carpet within a

Art Unit: 3622

determined period of time from the end of the estimated useful lifetime of the carpet. However, this would have been inherently necessary in order to replace and recycle the carpet at the end of life when the carpet is provided on a leasing arrangement. (Page 30, Column 2, lines 39 – 43)

- e. Fishbein discloses sorting the collected carpet according to polymeric fiber type. (Page 27, Column 2, lines 1 – 17, and Page 28, Column 1, lines 27 – 39)
- f. Fishbein discloses depolymerizing the polymeric fibers into their monomeric components. (Post consumer commercial carpet made from the company's nylon 6 fiber is produced)(Page 28, Column 2, lines 13 – 27)
- g. Fishbein discloses repolymerizing the monomeric components to form a recovered polymer composition. (Post consumer commercial carpet made from the company's nylon 6 fibers is produced)(Page 28, Column 2, lines 13 – 27)
- h. Fishbein discloses forming fibers from the recovered polymer composition, and then forming the fibers into a carpet. (Post consumer commercial carpet made from the company's nylon 6 fibers is produced)(Page 28, Column 2, lines 13 – 27)

Claim 18: Fishbein discloses the method of claim 17 wherein the polymeric fibers comprise at least one nylon. (Post consumer commercial carpet made from the company's nylon 6 fiber is produced)(Page 28, Column 2, lines 13 – 27)

Claim 19: Fishbein discloses the method of claim 17 further comprising providing the

Art Unit: 3622

consumer with an incentive to replace the carpet. (The disclosure that "Most of the voluntary take-back programs are not free" indicates that there are a couple of these programs that are free. Since the standard procedure is to charge a customer for the disposal of carpet in a landfill, offering such a take-back service that is free is an economic incentive to the customer) (Page 35, Column 1, lines 33 – 46)

Claim 20: Fishbein discloses the method of claim 17 further comprising providing the consumer with a replacement carpet. (Page 30, Column 2, lines 39 – 43)

Claim 23: Fishbein discloses a method for recovering carpet comprising nylon polymeric fibers.

- a. Selling carpet to a consumer. (Page 31, Paragraph 1) (Fishbein discloses that under a capital lease ownership of the carpet is transferred to the lessee which means a sale of the item has taken place. Fishbein also discloses in the cited section that Interface provides this type of lease.)
- b. While Fishbein does not explicitly disclose that a database is established and maintained that contains information regarding installed carpet and consumers it is obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art at the time the invention was made that a database containing the type of carpet, installation date, useful lifetime of the carpet, and consumer identification would have been necessary in order for Interface to purchase, maintain, replace the carpet over the period of the lease, and recycle it at the end of its useful life. (Page 30, Column 2, lines 39 – 43) One

would have been motivated to do this in order to provide the leasing customer with the services that have been promised.

- c. Additionally Fishbein does not explicitly disclose estimating the useful lifetime of the installed carpet, contacting the consumer, or collecting the carpet within a determined period of time from the end of the estimated useful lifetime of the carpet. However, this would have been inherently necessary in order to replace and recycle the carpet at the end of life when the carpet is provided on a leasing arrangement. (Page 30, Column 2, lines 39 – 43)
- d. Fishbein discloses sorting the collected carpet according to polymeric fiber type. (Page 27, Column 2, lines 1 – 17, and Page 28, Column 1, lines 27 – 39)
- e. Fishbein discloses depolymerizing at least one type of nylon polymeric fiber into its monomeric components. (Post consumer commercial carpet made from the company's nylon 6 fibers is produced)(Page 28, Column 2, lines 13 – 27)
- f. Fishbein discloses repolymerizing the monomeric components to form a recovered polymer composition. (Post consumer commercial carpet made from the company's nylon 6 fibers is produced)(Page 28, Column 2, lines 13 – 27)
- g. Fishbein discloses forming nylon fibers from the recovered polymer composition, and then forming the fibers into a carpet. (Post consumer commercial carpet made from the company's nylon 6 fibers is produced)(Page 28, Column 2, lines 13 – 27)

Claim 24: Fishbein discloses the method of claim 23 wherein the nylon polymeric fibers comprises nylon 6. (Page 28, Column 2, lines 13 – 27)

Claim 26: Fishbein discloses the method of claim 23 further comprising the step after the contacting step of providing the consumer with a replacement carpet. (Page 30, Column 2, lines 39 – 43)

Claim 27: Fishbein discloses the method of claim 23. While Fishbein is silent with regard to installing the carpet at the consumer's location it does disclose purchasing, leasing and maintaining the carpet. It would have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art at the time of the invention that the step of installing the carpet is an integral step in the leasing process. Furthermore it would have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art at the time of the invention that the carpet would have to be installed in order to perform the step of maintaining the carpet (Page 28, Column 2, lines 13 – 27). One would have been motivated to perform the installation step in order to entice customers to participate in the leasing arrangement.

Claim 28: Fishbein discloses the method of claim 23 further comprising providing the consumer with an incentive to replace the carpet. (The disclosure that "Most of the voluntary take-back programs are not free" indicates that there are a couple of these programs that are free. Since the standard procedure is to charge a customer for

Art Unit: 3622

the disposal of carpet in a landfill, offering such a take-back service that is free is an economic incentive to the customer) (Page 35, Column 1, lines 33 – 46)

Response to Arguments

4. Applicant's arguments filed February 12, 2007, have been fully considered but they are not persuasive. The arguments were addressed to the amendments made to the claims. The amendments have been addressed in the 35 USC 103 rejection above.

Conclusion

5. Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to John Van Bramer whose telephone number is (571) 272-8198. The examiner can normally be reached on 6am - 4pm Monday through Thursday.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Eric Stamber can be reached on (571) 272-6724. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Art Unit: 3622

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.

JVB
jvb

Eric W. Stamber
ERIC W. STAMBER
SUPERVISORY PATENT EXAMINER
TECHNOLOGY CENTER 3600